

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Acronyms	Mayra Garcia-DNER	"The acronyms list did not include an acronym to distinguish the Programa de Manejo y Conservación de Arrecifes de Coral (PMCAC) administered by the DNER. A section about this matter (reefs) is defined in page 129 of the CZMP draft without referring specifically to the mentioned program"	The correction was made and also, it was included information regarding the CRMCP (PMAC) in the section about corals.
INTRODUCTION	Mayra Garcia-DNER	Add the following information to the sentence " This process of revision and update is vested in different Commonwealth agencies and community-based environmental groups. (p. 14, second paragraph).	Included in the text.
CHAPTER 1	Edwin Hernández-Researcher	The draft of the Puerto Rico Coastal Management Program (PRCZMP) is a document with excellent information which shows the condition of over-exploitation of the coastal zone. One of the most critical aspects requiring immediate attention is to make the PRCZMP a document with a real approach on sustainable development, according to was defined in pp. 14 and 15. A brief review to Tables 1.1, 1.2 and 1.4 clearly indicates how the historic tendency has been against to sustainability. Rates of change of urban land in the coastal zone, particularly in PR's Northern coast, has been unsustainable. Particularly worrisome is the fact that at this rate practically half of Commonwealth coastal zone will be developed by year 2050. More dramatic is the estimate that 93% of the coastal zone in PR's Northeast will be developed by then. It is much needed that the PRCZMP revision establishes clear guidelines that delimitates how much longer this pattern of development is viable, safeguarding that this development is sustainable, where natural areas are protected, those recommended for protection, those agricultural reserves, those areas of agricultural value recommended for protection, watersheds, wetlands and pertinent buffer zones, particularly, keeping a set back or buffer zone against the rise in sea level.	General comment. A letter will be mailed to Mr. Hernandez in response to his suggestions and comments, which have been considered through the final document.
Non-point Source Pollution	Raul Santini-DNER	The section pertaining to matters of Non-point Sources of Pollution is too resumed, the comments we made in the first version should be incorporated. I understand that neither the errors from the first version of the disc were corrected, nor the comments we made from the evaluation of the first version of the document were incorporated. The section that addresses the issues of the Watershed as a planning unit is also too resumed. The Watershed as a planning unit is much more than what is described in this paragraph. / The section that talks about Cumulative Impacts is also too resumed, the concept should be better explained and examples should be provide in order to defined in a precisely way a problematic so important.	The information submitted by Mr. Santini was included in the final document of the PRCZMP.
Natural Systems	Mayra Garcia-DNER	"Other resources and systems that... floodplains (tierras inundables), bays... bioluminescence phenomenon". Should read: "flooded lands (áreas anegadas), bays... bioluminescence phenomenon". This because the term 'floodplains' applies to any other sector of the ones stipulated by the definition of the maritime zone. The description of the vegetation of flooded lands and floodplains is completely different. (p. 26, fifth paragraph)	Correction made
Coastal Sector	Mayra Garcia-DNER	The description of this area did not mention that this is PR's coastal sector with the higher number of nautical facilities. Historically, this has converted this sector in one of the most attractive points for local nautical tourism and worldwide. This brief statement establishes a preamble to incorporate later topics such as the necessary diversification of the nautical resource and the transformation of port centers as cost-effective options for the nautical industry (p. 27).	Included in the text.
	Julio Toro- DNER	It should be "canchas" instead of "cachas" (North sector, 7th paragraph, p.27)./ Besides Laguna de Piñones and Laguna Torrecilla, it should be included lagoons Agua Prieta and Grande in Fajardo, thus this is the only segment that includes four lagoons (Northeast sector, p. 28). / The coastal plains close to Tallaboa, Guayanilla, Guánica, Pole Ojea and Boquerón are mentioned. This should include the coastal plains of the whole sector, west of La Parguera (Southwest sector, p. 29). /The term "eolianite" should be included after "rocky" (Northwest sector, last paragraph, p. 30)	Corrections made.
	Mayra Garcia-DNER	Islands and Cays sector (4th paragraph): "recognize in the text the designation of the Canal Luis Peña Natural Reserve as a permanent no-fishing zone. This effort, accomplished through legislation on June 1st of 1999, allows, among other things, the gradual recovery of the ichthyofauna with recreational and commercial value. In turn, ensures the protection and conservation of coral reefs in the area. This statement supports the postulated of the CZMP in a holistic and integral way."	Included in the text.
Urban Sprawl Trends in the Coastal Sectors	Patricio Martinez Lorenzo-Home Builders Association	The techniques used to calculate this data were not described or specified. The projection is based on a classification of "urban land" with no specification if it is a reference to the land use classification of urban land, according to the land classification system established by the PRPB, irrespective if the land is been urbanized or not. On the other side, wetlands and reserves because of their legal designations and ecological attributes will not be urbanized in the near future. Then, it is important to discern if these lands are considered when making the projection.	Urbanized lands and not proposed urban lands according to the PRPB land use classifications were used. (Source: UPR Mayagüez- 1999 Land Use Change). The methodology used was included as a footnote in the final PRCZMP. A letter will be sent to clarify this concern.
Demand for land uses in the coastal zone	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	Correct paragraph of p. 40 so it reads: "Tourism projects are usually accompanied by marinas, docks, buoys, and other elements associated with water-dependent uses. These amenities or uses are located in the Territorial Waters of Puerto Rico, which are, also, Navigable Waters of the U.S. and public domain lands. Therefore, the location or construction of such facilities in these areas also requires a permit from the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) and a concession from the DNER Secretary".	Correction made.
	Edwin Hernández, PhD-Professor & Researcher: Grupo de Investigación en Arrecifes de Coral	Refer to Table I-2. Summary of site consultations. "Coastal growth rate is not sustainable" (p.39)/Refer to Table I-4. Summary of site consultations by coastal sector. Ex. Culebra and Vieques 15.25 times (1,525%) rise in the filing of site consultations from 1980s to 1990s.Ex. Culebra and Vieques 35 times (3,500%) rise in the approval of site consultations from 1980s to 1990s. Approvals: 25%, 57%, 48%. Second lower rate of approvals (1980s). First higher (1990s, 2000s tied with North).	General comment. Does not require additional actions.
	Julio Toro- DNER	It is indicated in the third paragraph that "It is of public knowledge the problem of illegal building in this region, particularly in the coast of the municipality of Rio Grande, where practically there is no free access to its coast", must be very careful when stating that this edifications area illegal when all of them have an approve site consultation and a development and construction permit from the RPA (p. 41).	Reviewed. Restated in the text.
	Mayra Garcia- DNER	General comment: The explanatory narrative regarding approved site consultations reveals an indisputable growth of the sectors. We suggest the incorporation as a serious problem under this section that the projects approved are not necessarily planned and approved considering the availability of the infrastructure provided or planned by the PRASA. This lack of correlation creates a saturation of the sanitary and storm sewerages available. Worse, it forces in this way the construction of septic tanks as the panacea to solve this situation. Our coastal waters remain as witness and silent receptors of the sanitary discharges not managed adequately.	The conflicts of urban development, the infrastructure and coastal resources are described in the sections of Coast-dependent Industry and Coastal Waters.

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Economic impact of the coastal zone	Julio Toro- DNER	Why the tourism industry is so ably camouflaged? Why must be use a classification from North America that does not include this industry? Only appears in the number 72 as "accommodation"? Nor this industry so important appears in Graphic 1. It is more difficult to understand this when in page 52 appears "Goals and objectives for public policy in tourism" as one of the eight areas or fundamental aspects of public policy of the Commonwealth government and in page 63 appears "Promote tourism as an essential economic activity for a sustainable economic development process."	Reviewed. The NAICS classification is the standard used by federal agencies, and locally it is used by the DTPW. The activities associated to tourism (accommodations, recreation, restaurants) are under the service sector because there is not a unique classification for tourism. However, the data from the PRTC was included.
CHAPTER 2	Patricio Martinez Lorenzo- Home Builders Association	New public policies: "Chapter 2 incorporates multiple changes to the objectives and public policy of the Plan, many of which are important changes when comparing with the previous document".	In Chapter 2 was clarified that the Program contains the Objectives and Public Policies of the Land Use Plan for Puerto Rico, adopted by the PRPB in year 1995 and included to the PRCZMP in 2003 through the mechanism of Routine Program Changes (RPC).
CHAPTER 3	Floods	Julio Toro- DNER	It is indicated that there are only 24 hectares (60 cuerdas) subject to flooding by storm surges. This number seems very low. We recommend reviewing this" (paragraph 3, p. 75).
	Edwin Hernández- Researcher	Need: Rigorous adoption of regulations to prevent excessive land leveling and paving.- I completely favor this recommendation. This is in the section of Coastal Hazards, but has critical implications in controlling the deterioration in water quality, turbidity and sedimentation in coral reefs and their associate ecosystems. Therefore, is one of the fundamental aspects required for reducing the rates of deterioration in coastal habitats" (p. 90).	The data was corroborated and the pertinent corrections were made. General comment: no action required.
Coastal erosion	Edwin Hernández- Researcher	Need: Protection of the coast through creative, environmentally safe and cost-effective measures. "I totally favor this recommendation. The most important aspect in this is to avoid at all costs continue experimenting with improvised solutions (i.e. the case of dredging Arecibo's bay in June 2000 and the eventual experimental disposition of dredged material in beach La Marginal), and in cases as mentioned previously. In most cases there are imminent erosion problems to one of the sides of structures, resulting in the relocation of coastal sand in the bottoms of many reefs, causing substantial damages to corals. (p. 103).	General comment: no action required.
Global warming and vulnerability to coastal hazards	Edwin Hernández- Researcher	Need: Incorporate, for planning purposes, the possibility of a rise in sea levels as a result of global warming. "This is a critical aspect!!!!"(p. 106).	General comment: no action required.
	Isamí Ayala (Municipality of Carolina):	It is necessary an update and review of the laws applicable to the zone and a clear definition of the Maritime Zone. Currently, what is relative to the coasts is ruled by the Law of Spanish Ports from year 1866 and the Puerto Rico Ports and Piers Law from 1968. The definition of the Maritime Zone has ambiguities that has let to diverse interpretations. In turn, this has caused diverse conflicts between communities and developers, because of projects approved in this zone that limit the access to public beaches. Our position is that the existing regulation applicable to development in the coast be revised. In this way, the sustainable development emphasized in this document could be reach and achieve the goals and objectives discussed herein.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Coastal wetlands	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	The numbers in the amount of hectares of coastal wetlands in page 108 (34,000) disagree with the amount presented in table 3-7 of page 110 where says that there is a total of 87,578 hectares. What is the reference of the first?	The first comment corresponds to coastal wetlands, according to the GAP Analysis document. Meanwhile the second comment corresponds to the benthic habitats mapped, according to the NOAA Benthic Habitat Mapping for Puerto Rico and US Virgin Islands. The methodology is included in a footnote in the same section of the final PRCZMP.
	Clarimar Diaz-DNER	Corrections to Table 3-6 Wetlands in Protected Areas (p. 109)./ Correct the title of table so it reads: Wetlands in Natural Reserves designated through administrative mechanisms ./ The executive order of August 27 of 2004 orders to the PRPB to work with the DNER the delimitation and designation of Cienaga las Cucharillas through resolution. / The Corredor Ecológico del Nordeste NR counts with a Resolution of designation by the PRPR (PU-02-2008-24(23)) from February 6 of 2008. / The Bosque Estatal Costero de Aguirre is a Forest Reserve. We clarify that a segment of the Punta Petrona NR is part of the Bosque Estatal Costero de Aguirre. / § JOBANERR is an Estuarine Reserve./ Cayo Ratonos is part of the Boquerón Commonwealth Forest NR. / Add Punta Viento as part of the Natural Reserves designated through legislative mechanism. This NR also has mangroves.	Comments made.
	Julio Toro- DNER	In Table 3-7, the sum of the three types of wetlands reaches 87,144 hectares, a difference of 434 from the sum presented in the table (p.110). It is indicated that palustrine wetlands include "grutas", what does this means? (Paragraph 5, p.111)	Corrections made.
	Edwin Hernández- Researcher	Need: Investigate the impact caused by the mitigation process on wetlands and apply more effectively, efficiently, and consistently the existing permit, consult, and endorsement mechanisms provided by laws, regulations, and processes geared towards protecting wetlands, particularly over coastal wetlands. Need: Establish in Puerto Rico a mechanism that allows for the reliable measurement of wetland mitigation in function and area. Wetlands: Site consultations should not be allowed in wetlands, unless it is a really critical project and/or vital for aspects of security or benefits the public and is absolutely necessary to develop it in the wetland. This will significantly reduce or end the need for mitigations. If necessary, mitigations should be monitored for longer periods (i.e. 10- 15 years minimum) and include as a requirement an impact evaluation of the mitigation over the ecosystem functions, in a way that ensure its resilience (p. 122).	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
	Edwin Muñoz- USFWS	"Wetlands: The document shows that there are numerous executive orders, laws, regulations that prohibit the cutting of mangroves, alteration of streams, etc, all of which are implemented by the different Commonwealth Agencies. However there is no local wetland regulatory process equivalent to that of the USACE or EPA. For example, Puerto Rico's water quality standards are supposed to be protective of wetlands and indigenous fauna, yet there are no biological water quality standards, all standards are physical or chemical, and there is no prohibition of the deposition of fill material in Commonwealth waters.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.

PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Coastal wetlands (cont.)	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	The filling of wetlands does not have definite legal standing under Commonwealth law. There is no equivalent to Section 404 of the Clean Water Act of Section 10 of the Rivers and Harbors Act which govern the dredge or filling waters and wetlands. In reality, wetland regulation and protection is mainly left to the Federal regulatory agencies; to the point that wetlands impacts and mitigation are sometimes not discussed in the local environmental impact statement process, but left for the later federal permit process. Of particular concern are the isolated wetlands and freshwater seasonal wetlands which recently have lost some of that Federal protection and which do not seem to have any protection under Commonwealth regulations".	
Reefs	Julio Toro- DNER	"Cowardin (1979) does not include reefs as wetlands (paragraph 1, p. 126) (see p. 3 of his publication)"	Reference used: Lewis M. Cowardin, Virginia Carter, Francis C. Golet, and Edward T. LaRoe. Classification of Wetlands and Deepwater Habitats of the United States.
	Mayra Garcia- DNER	This paragraph mentions issues related to anthropogenic events and its effects over coral reefs. Abandon vessels is a serious problem that is increasing and, at the moment, the legal options available to attend this matter should be studied. These vessels, generally stranded or not stranded, are abandoned by its owner with their well-known effects over coastal ecosystems.	It was included as a section in the subject of Coastal Waters. It was utilized as background information. NOAA, Abandoned Vessels, Puerto Rico Inventory.
		Incorporate Acroporids North Zone- Proactive steps to designate a 'special' area for coral protection. It is also suggested to incorporate future actions to contemplate matters related to <i>Montastraea</i> corals and the legislative appropriations for granting public funds for the creation of a Management Plan for the Tres Palmas Marine Reserve in Rincón (p. 133).	The information about Acroporids was included in the North zone. It is proposed to request an RPC to designate a SPA for corals.
	Edwin Hernández- Researcher: Grupo de Investigación en Arrecifes de Coral	"The extensions of the ecological damage to Puerto Rico's reefs have not been evaluated because of the absence of comprehensive studies on coral reef systems. Nonetheless, currently there are myriad programs that monitor changes in the structure of coral communities in Puerto Rico (Matos, Díaz & García, 2000). " This statement contained in page 128-129 is false. In Puerto Rico there is documentation more than reasonable to sustain the argument that the ecological damage to reefs is considerable. Examples of this include the work of McKenzie & Benton (1972), Goenaga & Cintrón (1979), Goenaga (1988), Goenaga & Boulon (1992), Hernández-Delgado (1992, 2000, 2005, and more additional references), Weil et al. (2002), García-Sais et al. (2003, 2008), and Ballantine (2008), just to mention the main studies".	Examined and included recent information, as an example, from the report <i>The State of Coral Reef Ecosystems of Puerto Rico: 2008</i> .
		Need: Designate the Bahía de Jobos y Mar Negro area as a Natural Reserve. Need: Prepare and adopt management plans for the areas designated as Natural Reserves. Need: To designate island areas containing reef systems as Special Planning Areas (SPA). / This goals are important, however, is worrisome that the first priority is the designation of Bahía de Jobos as a NR when there are more than 35 NR without a management plan, and many of them with no manager officer, without a budget for management or conditions for doing it. Until this moment, there is no uniformity in the criteria for designation and the extension of NR, what has resulted in the designation of NR or Marine Extensions with a whole series of variations in its geographic area and lineal extension with no relation with their biological, ecological and environmental realities (p.133).	The first need was restated as "Evaluate the benefits of designating the Bahía de Jobos y Mar Negro area as a Natural Reserve". It is important to indicate that the Needs are not organized by priority.
		This section is neuralgic, considering the ecological catastrophe been observed in our coral reefs in the past decades. The document did not mention the more important references about the condition of the coral reefs in Puerto Rico. Nor does mention the impact of global warming over the island in recent years, neither mention the priority of protecting Acroporid corals.	The information from NOAA's document "The State of Coral Reef Ecosystems of Puerto Rico: 2008" was included in PRCZMP. Also, it was included the designation of the critical habitat of the <i>A. palmata</i> and <i>A. cervicornis</i> . At the time of preparing the document for public meetings, there was only the recommendation for the designation from the NMFS and as this was stated in the document then.
		The pattern of deterioration seen in coral reefs in Puerto Rico suggest the urgency of having the CZMP, administered by the DRNA, take diverse immediate actions conducting to the management and recovery of coral reefs. Among them we could mention:	
		1. Enforce Law 147, particularly what concerns the need to prepare EIS of projects that could directly or indirectly affect coral reefs and associate ecosystems. Also, it is required to enforce the Section referring to the impact of pollution over these. 2. Revise and update the Inventory of Coral Reefs of Puerto Rico from 1979.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made. Recommended as a Research component.
	3. Prepare a specific inventory about the patterns of spatial distribution and the actual condition of Acroporid corals (listed as threaten species under the ESA) and the corals of the complex <i>Montastraea annularis</i> (<i>M. annularis</i> , <i>M. faveolata</i> , <i>M. franksi</i>), whose populations have shown decreases significantly hazardous during the last decade, even in reefs distant from the coast.	Recommended as a Research component.	
	4. Develop a National Plan for the Management of Coral Reefs in Puerto Rico to be tied to the development of an Integral Plan for the Management of the Coastal Zone.	Included as background information: "Under the Coral Reef Initiative, in the context of local action strategies (LAS), the Puerto Rico Coral Reefs Management and Conservation Plan is being developed".	
	5. Develop management plans for all the Marine Protected Areas (MPA) in harmony with the National Plan.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.	
	6. The PRPB should complete the revision process and implement a sustainable land use plan.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.	
	7. Implement programs for a multidisciplinary ecological monitoring of coral reefs (i.e. benthic communities, fish, environmental parameters, processes at the ecosystem level) that respond to experimental questions and hypothesis concerning to measure the effectively of management programs and to determine the capacities and resilience of the ecosystem.	Recommended as a Research component.	
	8. The historical past is the key to understand the present and establish possible predictions for the future. It is required to conduct a study of the paleo-climatology and the reconstruction of the environmental history of the coral reefs in Puerto Rico through a broad geographic scale using corals annual growth bands as historic registries of environmental change and climate change. Through the use of appropriate metrics its correlation with actions and management decisions, changes in the land use patterns, etc. could reveal historic quantitative measurements on how the political decisions regarding land use and the coastal zone have influenced this ecosystems.	Recommended as a Research component.	

PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT		
Reefs (cont.)	Edwin Hernández-Researcher: Grupo de Investigación en Arrecifes de Coral	9. Review, update and refocus the priorities identified in the "Local Action Strategy Plan" to include priorities such as how the effects of climate change, and the recovery of coral reefs and reef fisheries. It is required to begin addressing broad problems, which possibly require remedial actions or complex mitigations, and not only focus in small and local problems.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.		
		10. Develop an initiative for the recovery of coral reefs that identifies the priority areas for ecological restoration, identify and document the actual condition and spatial distribution of those priority species for the development of strategies for their propagation and reintroduction to the coral reefs; and that promote aquaculture and the transplant of corals cultivated as recovery strategies.	Recommended as a Research component.		
		11. Develop researches conducting to increase the successful survival of juveniles, fertilization of gametes and the recruitment of coral larvae.	Recommended as a Research component.		
		12. Reevaluate the effectiveness of the traditional management model for the MPAs centered in the government with options of participatory management and the co-management as a mechanism for improving management effectiveness.	Aspect considered in the final PRCZMP.		
		13. Develop articulated research programs in coral reefs, in coordination with the Caribbean Coral Reef Institute (CCRI) and the Center for Applied Tropical Ecology and Conservation, from the UPR, which respond to specific questions, mainly with applications to management and documentation of the long-term impact of climate change, instead of developing isolated projects and with possibly little consistency among themselves. This implies the improvement of the mechanisms of communication and integration among the NOAA, DNER, CCRI and the UPR.	Recommended as a Research component.		
		14. Develop more comprehensive studies about the current condition of deep coral reefs.	Recommended as a Research component.		
		15. Create a technical, scientific and functional team for rapid responses to ecological surprises, environmental emergencies and criminal incidents in coral reefs.	The DNER develop a protocol for such purposes after the spill occurred on the South coast		
		16. Develop standard operational procedures for responding to emergencies.	The DNER develop a protocol for such purposes after the spill occurred on the South coast		
		17. Develop an aggressive initiative for popular education about the conservation, management and restoration of coral reefs.	Recommendation was included.		
		18. Delimit the Maritime Zone throughout the archipelago of Puerto Rico.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.		
		19. Strengthen the PRCZMP Culebra Segment from 1976. This document, still legally in force, has been repeatedly ignored by the Commonwealth and the Culebra municipal government when evaluating and continuously approving various types of projects on the island.	The document was updated as part of the process of revision and update of the PRCZMP.		
		20. Assert the definition of all the islands, islets and cays as part of the coastal zone when evaluating proposed projects.	The whole coastal zone is considered at the moment of making determinations corresponding to the Federal Consistency Process.		
		21. Promote the development of effective mechanisms for the protection of watersheds in the revision and final approval of the Land Use Plan. The condition of coral reefs and associate ecosystems greatly depends in the actions allowed by the government in watersheds.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.		
		22. Assert the dispositions of the Regulation for erosion control and sedimentation prevention.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.		
		23. Develop and implement as soon as possible aggressive strategies, as well as incentives, for the control of non-point sources of pollution, mainly fecal pollution.	Restated: Develop effective mechanisms to ensure compliance with the control measures for erosion and sedimentation and non-point sources of pollution which affect coral reefs.		
		24. Develop a medium-term plan (5 years) to increase the treatment level of used waters discharged through outfalls which still discharge waters with a primary level of treatment.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.		
		25. Review the dispositions of Law No. 66 of 1975, as amended by Law No. 76 of 2002, for eliminating the grip of partisan politics from the Board of Directors of the Culebra Conservation and Development Authority. It is recommended that this type of initiatives count with the effective participation of diverse interested sectors, so it strengthens and democratizes the analysis processes, strategies development, action plan development and making decisions.	Action outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.		
		Research (high priority)	Edwin Hernández-Researcher	"We agree in this priority. However, it is not mentioned in the document the research efforts developed by DNER consultants or by the Caribbean Coral Reef Institute, or by the Center for Applied Tropical Ecology and Conservation, both from the UPR, efforts where the DNER itself is a direct collaborator. These institutions are possibly undertaken the major efforts in coral reefs research in Puerto Rico, besides other series of efforts from NOAA and the Department of Marine Sciences of the UPR in Mayagüez. Nor is discuss in this document what the impacts of climate change on reefs were. This is one of the most important elements that should be attended by the CZMP". (p. 134)	Current known research initiatives were incorporated as background information.
		Mangroves		Need: Regulation prohibiting alteration of mangroves. "This recommendation is critical for the protection of reefs, sea grass and the essential habitat of fish. This should be one of the main priorities" (p. 145).	General comment. No action required.
		Sand dunes		Need: Rigorously enforce the regulation of the extraction of Earth crust components and enforce limitations imposed on extraction permits. This recommendation is really important for the conservation of watersheds, rivers water quality, estuaries and coasts and therefore, in the conservation of coral reefs and coastal ecosystems" (p. 151).	General comment. No action required.
Beaches	Edwin Hernández-Researcher	Need: Avoid the exclusion of public to beaches, by implanting the existing legal and regulatory framework. "This has become a recurring problem throughout the whole Island, particularly in Culebra in recent years. The DNER has to make its better effort to ensure free access to the coast". (p. 160)	Restated: Maximize public access to Puerto Rico's coast and beaches in compliance with the current laws and regulations.		
		Need: Extending the scope of environmental justice evaluations to coastal projects. "It is a recurrent problem that they are not adequately evaluated or simply not evaluated. It is a consequence of the fast-tracking. Between the most important recommendations of the CZMP should be a specific recommendation for eliminating the fast-tracking processes in cases of projects proposed in the coastal zone or in those areas close to it that could be highly sensitive". (p.160)	Restated: Strengthen the development of coastal communities by making them more productive and resistant to coastal risks.		

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Beaches (cont.)	Edwin Hernández-Researcher	Need: Immediate attention to the problem of litter and debris on beaches. "The problem of fecal pollution by non-point sources is as bad as or more severe than that of waste. It is required immediate attention through a monitoring program of water's microbiology quality and through studies employing molecular techniques to document the presence of pollution using highly sensitive processes". (p. 174)	Restated: Promotion of adequate management of solid and marine waste
Beaches (cont.)	Carlén González Santiago (Student from the Planning Graduate School)	<i>(Summary of comment)</i> The PRZMP should include the concept of security in beaches. One of the obstacles preventing the general public from fully enjoying the beaches is the lack of minimal security services (such as professional lifeguards). The lack of personnel in place with the capacity to attend emergencies in beaches could be related to the number of people that have died in beaches because of drowning. Programs and /or projects taking place in the coastal environment should consider the natural elements and the species configuring beach dynamics. Projects should be cost-effective for the coastal environment and the general public. This should consider also that the use of motor vehicles along the beach represents a risk to organisms, dunes, and causes erosion, among others.	General comment. No action required.
Wildlife	Edwin Hernández-Researcher	Need: Resources for the adequate management of Natural Reserves. "Strongly agree. It is require an allocating of a reasonable budget to the Natural Reserves, Refuges and Wildlife Division, as well as to the Natural Heritage Program and the Marine Resources, so they can fulfill their ministerial duties. It is worrisome that the list of threatened fauna and/or in danger does not mention the Acroporid corals, even though there are listed as threatened species under de ESA since May 2006". (p. 182).	Restated as: Develop strategies to optimize sustainable management of Natural Reserves so they incorporate the protection, knowledge and enjoyment of wildlife.
		Concern: Changes introduced to Regulation 4 of Zoning (without preparing an EIS, in violation of the Environmental Public Policy Act and Law 147) relaxed the permitted uses in the coastal zone, facilitating the processes for obtaining permits, eliminating, in many cases, the requirements for site consultation and the requirements of compliance with the Environmental Public Policy Act. What would have more weight? The federal plan for the management of PR's coastal zone? Or Regulation 4 at Commonwealth level? (p. 183)	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made. A letter will be mailed in response to the comments since they are two different application scopes.
Coastal waters	Julio Toro- DNER	The 4th paragraph indicates that through the Island run 224 rivers from which 54 discharge to the littoral, besides 553 streams with no name. However, in the table presented in the same page titled "Puerto Rico Coastal Waters" there are 224 rivers and 553 streams. The coastal zone does not include so many rivers and streams" (p. 185).	Reviewed. Restated in the text.
	Edwin Hernández-Researcher	Water quality standards (Table 3-7): Review the definition of SB so it includes all the coral reefs, including those located more than 500 m from the shore, based on the presumption that: 1) these are waters where direct contact can occur; and 2) these are waters where seafoam grows. If these systems reach 10.3 nm, then, the entire platform should be SB" (p. 190).	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
	Edwin Muñoz-USFWS	"Water Quality: We recommend that DNER provide a more detailed list of SE (ecological exceptional) waters to PR EQB. Currently there are only two or three water bodies currently on the list, more should be included. The document mentions that there are numerous water quality problems in Puerto Rico. We believe that the opportunity exist to resolve two of these issues. The dissolved oxygen water quality standard for coastal waters (4 mg/l) is one of the lowest in the eastern seaboard; it is lower than that of the neighboring US Virgin Islands, which share the same waters. In addition, the WQS for temperature is one of the highest at 90 degrees F or 32.2 C. Neither of these two standards is protective of fish, shellfish or sensitive life stages. While this specific issue is not mentioned in the CZMP, it can be resolved by working jointly with PR EQB to modify these Water Quality Standards to be more protective of sensitive life stages. The Service is willing to work with DNER in addressing the above issues with PR EQB".	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
	Edwin Hernández-Researcher	Need: Additional criteria for dredging and filling. "Prohibit dredging and filling in reef and sea grass areas. Establish buffer zones with a minimum of 500 meters. In exceptional cases where this activities should be performed in zones of less than 500 m, establish all possible measures to minimize impacts in the short term and those permanents" (p. 203).	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
	Isami Ayala (Municipality of Carolina)	The Beach Monitoring and Public Notification Program should not be limited to 'balnearios'. There are beaches visited and used throughout the year. As an example, the beach El Alambique in Isla Verde and the beach in the Ocean Park area, in Condado, are two of the most visited beaches by the population of Carolina, Condado and Isla Verde, and conform part of the touristic zone of the North area of the Island.	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
		It should be included the exploration of more precise methods for monitoring microbiology quality of coastal waters, specifically in the more visited beaches. Among these is the Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR) method, which could be used to measure the fecal pollution in the water. This method identifies, with more precision, the origin of fecal pollution utilizing specific reagents from different hot blood animals (cattle, horses, domestic pets, chickens, etc.) that represent the main indicators of fecal pollution.	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Coastal Forest	Isami Ayala (Municipality of Carolina):	According to what it is established in the Piñones SPA Land Use Plan and the Municipal Land Use Plan of Carolina, it should be included as an specific public policy the acquisition by the DNER of the lands contiguous to the Piñones Commonwealth Forest, in order to conserve their current conditions and preserve the integrity of the forest. Through the years, these lands have been subject to speculation and are threaten by development proposals in the zone.	The lands have been acquired by the DNER and the designation of Torrejilla Alta as a Natural Reserve is proposed, which is under the consideration of the PRPB.
Coast-dependent industry	Edwin Hernández-Researcher	Need: Officially adopt management plans for the SPAs and develop strategies for their implementation with the goal of minimizing conflict of use. Absolutely! Only by giving seriousness and legal claws to the SPA management plans they will be respected. What would have more weight? The SPA management plan? Or Regulation 4 at Commonwealth level? (p.223)	Restated: Officially adopt management plans for the SPAs and develop strategies for their implementation with the goal of minimizing conflict of use
	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	Section 3.3.1, p. 215. In this section is determined that one of the main redevelopment approaches for coastal areas with structures in disuse or underutilized is "revert to the extent possible the occupation of coastal space by urban uses and return the scenic character and previous condition to the littoral." In light of the complexity of determining the 'natural' condition of an area, especially when considering the natural and human factors that has altered the profile of the zone along decades and centuries (constructions, reconstructions, coastal erosion, deforestation and reforestation, multiple uses, rise in water level, among others), I ask for an explanation on what factors will determine the previous condition to which will be authorize to "reverse" a determinate coastal zone. Likewise, I ask for the definition of the criteria, 'natural' as well as anthropogenic, historic and/or cultural, that will be taken in consideration for determining the value or scenic character of a littoral or coastal zone, where natural areas are protected, those recommended for protection, those agricultural reserves, those areas of agricultural va	Restated in the background information
		Section 3.3.1.B.1., p. 221. This section identifies difficulties in the implementation of the regulation for Tourism Interest Zone.	
		a. Request the presentation in this document of the measures to be taken to solve them.	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Coast-dependent industry (cont.)	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	We have mentioned in several occasions the need, desirability and practical value of including the citizenry for the success and effectiveness of this Management Plan. This aspect is equally recognized in this document by mentioning that "citizen participation should be promoted in the decision-making process by the Government since it has proven to be a very useful tool". (p. 221). In consideration of this:	A letter will be sent in response to the concerns and comments. The document presented is a revision and update of the Program. Its purpose is to update the background information, include current legislation and regulation and incorporate to the document the elements that have been included through routine changes during the last years. The revision and update

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
		<p>a. We propose the establishment of an organism or committee specifically directed to the facilitation, arrangement and promotion of this type of participation and citizenry collaboration. This organism should ensure the existence and implementation of effective consultation mechanisms and citizenry oversee within the planning frame and the implementation of the Program.</p> <p>b. Citizenry participation requires an initiative of information and orientation to citizens and communities about the goals and mechanisms of this Program and the importance of the complete and consistent implementation of its guidelines. This dimension of citizenry inclusion could, importantly, include training workshop to citizens or volunteers willing to participate in monitoring activities, documentation and the orientation required by the Program. This type of collaboration will greatly contribute to the sustainability in the short and long-term of the Program.</p> <p>c. We request a revision of the guidelines for the public hearing process, so as to facilitate and invite citizen's participation. In particular, we suggest providing the adequate time to review the documents under discussion, according to the extension and public importance of such; likewise, adjusting the time of the public hearings to fit the discussion of extensive documents, as it is the case of the PRCZMP. We suggest, in addition, to enrich this consultation process by allowing the use of diverse types of documents from the citizens, as an example, in the case of a public hearing we participated, visual and audiovisual material.</p> <p>Section 3.3.1, p. 224. This section determined the need to establish the Design Guidelines for Redevelopment Areas.</p> <p>a. I consider of great importance the development of this Development Guidelines for Redevelopment Areas, especially in terms of its value for the ecological redefinition and for recreation areas and as an alternative to urban sprawl. I hope these are made public promptly.</p> <p>b. In light of the extension, importance and diversity of proposals regarding the use and redevelopment of the military facilities returned-including zones of great extension and special ecological situation, as it is the Ramey base and Roosevelt Roads- as well as the structural, environmental and historic particularities of these spaces, I request the creation of Development Guidelines dedicated specifically to establish a clear public policy in respect to the design guidelines and the redevelopment of this zone previous its military use.</p> <p>c. I request to include in this document the date when the Redevelopment Guidelines will be available.</p>	<p>During the last year, the revision and update incorporated the cycle of public meetings as a mechanism of participation. Because the Program is a dynamic document, the citizens will have the opportunity to participate in diverse stages of the process.</p> <p>Restated in the PRCZMP because it is outside of the Program's scope.</p>
	Mayra Garcia- DNER	<p>General Comments: "Rising prices of public spaces on the North coast including from Pta. Chivato to Pta. Maldonado to provide spaces for the development of infrastructure projects, evidence the urgency of designating areas to propitiate facilities for access to the sea and recreational fishing in Puerto Rico. This exercise could be considered through plans for land acquisition for this specific use or as a result of negotiations for mitigation actions in major projects.</p> <p>The development and use of facilities for access to the sea, is a concept very well accepted by users of recreational boats [DNER. (2003). Development of Boating and Fishing Access Facilities.] These use their own boat with a trailer to access oceanic waters in practically all the Island's coasts. Ramps for boats to provide access to vessels with length between 14 to 27 feet has been approved as a concept very entrenched because of our concept of islanders and the need of direct contact as exercises of recreation and amusement. /The increase in fuel costs with direct repercussions over recreational boat users is reflected through a marked reduction in the acquisition of vessels (Taken from Lectura bombas Compañía Gula-Marina Pto Chico-Julio 2008). The change to boats with a smaller length that allows to keep active the recreational boating lover is a voluntary choice to minimize possible economic impacts.</p> <p>Although the DNER maintains active a program for the development of facilities for access to the sea, the identification of adequate spaces for the construction of these types of facilities sometimes becomes an odyssey. Despite being a resource completely dependable on the coast, the competition for housing development that guarantees a privileged ocean view, the development of hotels and the proliferation of gastronomic shops obstruct the new or future availability of spaces in the coast. The trend for new and diverse options in the use of aquatic sports with lower economic impact propitiates that for the development of facilities to access the sea not only consider boats dragged by trailers but also kayaks, canoes, paddle boats and pedal boats, among others. The support to this type of project should be maintained thus it offers the opportunity to establish social justice in the enjoyment of our spectacular coastal landscapes to all equally.</p>	<p>General comment. No action required.</p> <p>Included Need: Provide more opportunities for public access through the promotion of installations with access to the sea and recreational fishing in Puerto Rico.</p>
Energy	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	<p>Section 3.3.4.A.3, p. 241. This section discusses specific policies regarding an energy installation in the Island. In attention to energetic use and consumption patterns in Puerto Rico, I suggest to give special implementation emphasis to the last aspect mentioned in this section: "Promote a better use of energetic resources to propitiate and stimulate a reasonable reduction in the continuous increase in the Commonwealth's energy demand". This not only will result in more sustainable energy consumption patterns- in environmental terms, as infrastructural- but also facilitates the transit to new ways of energy production.</p>	<p>These are part of the OPP-PRLUP (1995) and are included as part of the PRCZMP policies.</p>
Recreation	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	<p>Section 3.4.D, p. 252. This section indicates the need to "Require prior to the approval of any tourism proposal, even if it is traditional tourism, an analysis of factors such as: limits of acceptable change, the ecological footprint of the development and the capacity to manage the natural and environmental resource.</p> <p>a. We suggest to require this type of study not only to tourism proposals waiting for approval, but also to existing and established touristic projects to ensure its adoption to the guidelines of sustainable development, as well as to maintain documentation of these projects impacts.</p> <p>Given the close relationship of tourism in Puerto Rico with its coastal zones, as well as the emphasis aspired to give this industry in the Island, both factors well mentioned in the document, we suggest to dedicate a section of this document to the analysis of the circumstances, impact and proposals of the public policy pertinent to coastal tourism in Puerto Rico, the same way is made with the sections on sand extraction, mining development, energy and recreation. This last section (Recreation) mentions coastal tourism, but we understand that this, as an industry focused in development plans, deserves a space of analysis and elaboration more broad".</p> <p>Section 3.4. This section addresses the recreational uses of the coastal zones, focusing, primarily, in recreational uses associated with beaches and navigation. However, there are multiple underwater practices requiring attention when establishing a policy on the use of coastal zones; these include activities such as snorkelling and diving, as well as the mode of spearfishing. These types of activities, tends to concentrate in zones of the ecosystem with great ecological value and truly scenic, as coral reefs and thalassia seagrass prairies are. Spearfishing is especially threatening and damaging to these systems, because is a practice highly invasive often resulting in damages to coral structures either by direct impact to the surface of the coral or because of spikes, rods and wires are left in these areas as a result of this activity. In addition, this practice, in public use zones, as often found, could represent a risk to personal health and security.</p>	<p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.</p> <p>This process of review and update does not include the establishment of additional public policies.</p> <p>Issue attended by the Coral Reefs Management and Conservation Plan. Once the adoption of this Plan is formalized, the PRCZMP will proceed to request a routine Program change.</p>
Recreation (cont.)	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	<p>a. I request to include a section on the impact and public policy regarding underwater recreational activities in this document. In particular, I request to include a public policy and clear implementation regarding the practice of spearfishing in littoral areas, specifically in reef zones and areas used by bathers.</p>	<p>This process of review and update does not include the establishment of additional public policies.</p>

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
		b. Similarly, I request to include a clear policy regarding the information and education for practitioners of snorkeling and diving, in consideration to the delicacy of these systems and resources enjoyed through these sports, as well as its value and natural, cultural and touristic importance. / In terms of recreational uses both aquatic and out of the water in the littoral zone, the trash thrown away by users represent an aspect of major impact to biological and aesthetic dimensions of coastal areas. / a. Taking these into consideration I request to clarify in this document the measures to be taken to reduce these impacts./ b. Similarly, the impact of trash thrown away by users should be taken in consideration in the planning of traffic zones for pedestrian and cyclist, between other urban zones and littorals proposed in this section 3.5.	This process of review and update does not include the establishment of additional public policies.
Fishing	Julio Toro- DNER	Eureka Marine Products ceased operations" (p. 262).	Corrected
	Edwin Hernández- Researcher	<u>Need: Investigate fluctuations in population's reproductive behavior and recuperation after exploitation of populations or physical damage, effects of environmental variables, among others (LeGore et al., 2006).</u> It is critical to develop programs for monitoring fish communities independently from the fisheries. Based on statistics, the situation is alarming and requires serious and immediate actions (i.e. Marine Reserves where no fishing is allowed, expansion of fishing closed season). Need more studies to identify potential areas of aggregations for the spawning of main fish species.	Included
		Enforce Law 278 and Law 307 of Marine Reserve (3% platform). A medium term (5 years) reevaluate and increase to 10% platform./Increase the operational budget and for education of the DNER Rangers Corp. /Create a fund for the designation and management of Marine Reserves from fishing licenses or the sale of vessels, fishing gear or diving equipment" (p. 264).	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
		Create an educative program about Marine Reserves for fishermen.	Included.
CHAPTER 4			
	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	We consider Chapter 4 as the core of the document since it is where the means to exert control are established by which the Commonwealth administers, exercises control and attempt to improve the condition of the coastal zone and remedy existing problems. Special care and attention should be taken in the final redaction of this chapter. One of the problems confronted when implementing the PRCZMP through the processes of Federal Consistency is the confusion caused by the language when the term 'public policy' is used. In section 930.11 (h) of the regulation ruling the procedures of Federal Consistency, the term 'enforceable policy' is defined as laws, regulations and other regulatory instruments. "Enforceable" is translated in Spanish as "exigible" meaning chargeable or that can be required to comply. The term "policy" is translated as: politic, course, custom, plan, system and/or action plan. In Puerto Rico the term 'public policy' is usually understood as a general guide about how things should be done. However, federal public employees who do not speak Spanish understand the term "enforceable policy", as laws, regulations and more specific requirements by which uses and activities in the coastal zone are managed. For this reason, must be careful with the language used in document, especially in the translation. To solve the previous matter the following is suggested: Chapter 2 should be titled: The PRCZMP as the coastal element of Puerto Rico's Land Use Plan. This chapter should be limited to explain the relation between the PRCZMP and the PR Land Use Plan. The document "Objectives and Public Policies of Puerto Rico's Land Use Plan" should only be cited and included as an appendix of the Program. 2- Pages 269- 306: The main elements of the CZMP should be expressed as follows: 4.1 Public Policies applicable to guide development in Puerto Rico's Coastal Zone/4.2 Active management of coastal resources/4.3 Promotion of sustainable coastal development/4.4 Research. It is extremely important to change the definition of topic 4.1. 3- The second paragraph of the introduction to topic 4.1 (page 270) should be more specific and it is recommended that reads like: "This Chapter presents the PRCZMP divided into four key elements: Guiding development in public and private property through the implementation of regulatory policies for development."	Corrected
			The OPP-PRLUP (1995) are included as part of Chapter 2 and the Introduction deepens on the relationship of the PRCZMP as the coastal element of the PRLUP.
			The topic remains as the original PRCZMP.
			Included.
Coordination between agencies	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	The development of this Management Plan requires the coordination, agreement and collaboration of multiple agencies and government organisms (DNER, EQB, PRPB, among the most determinants), what mechanisms will be established to ensure the coordinated action of these agencies and the overseen of the joint work in the implementation of this Program?	The program identifies the mechanisms for interagency coordination.
	Edwin Muñoz- USFWS	"As stated in the document four PR agencies play a major role in implementing the PRCZMP and regulating activities in the coastal zone. It has been the Service's experience that because of this fragmentation, it is difficult to successfully implement the numerous strategies outlined in the previous PRCZMP".	A letter will be sent to attend the concern.
Land Use Plans	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	In page 271, before mentioning Law No. 75, it should be included a paragraph describing the Federal Consistency Process and the role of the PRPB as the Commonwealth agency designated for its implementation. This part could include more specific information about the Federal Consistency Certification. It is very important to mention this, since it is the procedure strengthening and making possible the implementation of the PRCZMP.	This information was included, and, besides, Appendix 4 includes the Federal Consistency Overview 2009 and the corresponding regulation.
Municipal Autonomy and Municipal Land Use Plans	Isamí Ayala (Municipality of Carolina)	"We agree that Municipal Land Use Plans for coastal municipalities should consider the rise in the average sea level in their plans and regulations, so as to protect life and property of citizens. However, we understand that documents such as this and from agencies such as the PRPB, DNER, Commonwealth legislature and the Executive, establishing a clear public policy through its laws and regulations, on how development in these areas will be managed which in the advancement of this phenomenon will acquire a category of areas susceptible to natural risks and where currently a large part of the population lives. Coastal municipalities could assist in implanting established laws and regulations, but it should be clarify which will be the procedures or the plans to be followed."	Restated in the final document because was outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Active management of coastal resources	Clarimar Díaz- DNER	"It is important to indicate that the Land Resources Planning Division, unit in charge of coordinating tasks 1.1 and 1.5 (Management of Special Planning Areas (SPA) and the Designation and Planning of Natural Reserves), is to where the development proposals that in some way could impact systems or natural resources in Natural Reserves or in the SPA's are referred. This is so, because most of the available information about these areas is this Division (maps, delimitation, designation documents, management plans, files, etc)."	Information included.
		"We recommend that as part of the "Other measures to protect coastal resources" it is evaluated and considered the elaboration of a Natural Reserves Law or a Law for Natural Protected Areas whose dispositions contemplate Natural Reserves" (p. 301).	Included as a recommendation: Desirability that Puerto Rico adopts a law regarding protected natural areas which includes NR in its dispositions.
Research	Julio Toro- DNER	"It should include research about the status of our estuaries" (p. 305).	Included.
CHAPTER 5: The Culebra Segment			

PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Introduction	Coralatons	"Please include some mention regarding the former Mayor Hon DonMonchin Feliciano's contributions to the creation of Law 66, 1975. This law, if ever implemented and enforced is important and it should clearlystate that locals were concerned about a development boom that could change the nature and character of the island to that already being witnessed by their relatives living in the U.S. Virgin Islands. In addition to resource conservation, a major concern then, as well as today, is development pressures resulting in the gentrification of the local people of this island. It would be great if this could be reflected in the introduction as well. It reads a bit like it was created as a Navy plot and does not reflect local support of the law as it creates public policy to protect ecological integrity of the island. The most important aspect of Law 66, 1975 was that it created as public policy the protection of the ecological integrity of the island for the people of Culebra. This did not change with the 2002 amendment. This verbiage is very important to include and even without ACDEC fulfilling its nondiscretionary duties of oversight as described, we were able to use the previous Culebra Segment to defeat an illegal segregation (endorsed by ACDEC) through the courts. Please make the importance of this Law to protect environment clear. This introduction should also discuss the CZM Act, with emphasis on the spirit of the law's intent to protect coastal resources and the protection of the millennia old legislative concept of the Public's Trust as it should stand to protect shared resources. For example, a prospective coastal property owner needs to clearly understand that while they may own coastal wetlands and shoreline, they defer to the public's rights to enjoy them and access to them. Strong wording in this plan may help to avoid future conflicts, and support the agency in legal disputes, where private owners propose development projects that threaten these critical resources"(p. 308).	Some historic information was included in the Introduction.
		"The waters between St. Thomas and Culebra are known for generating the greatest number of water spouts in the world. (citation pending)Anecdotal evidence from locals suggested Hugo generated at least one tornado which left a track up a hillside on the SE side of the island. Tropical storms and hurricanes should not be limited to uncommon.	General comment.
		Culebra is on the path of the Caribbean hurricane belt. This is critical for future decision making regarding offshore oil drilling, industrialized wind energy and development of volcanic soils where non-point source pollution runoff has already caused serious if not irreparable contamination to the bay. More storms, more frequent storms, contrasted with the desertification of the island are important considerations where development is concerned. While there may be some political debate regarding the current influence human behaviors on the climate, this debate is directly linked to special interests. The current scientific consensus is firm, and is predicting more frequent and intense storms for this region. (SCIENCE, citations pending).	General comment.
		There has been some speculation among geologists that the recent and rapid melting of polar ice will result in shifts in tectonic plates. This is expected to result in more earth quakes, a percentage of which will generate Tsunamis in this region. (Documentation pending). All future coastal zone planning must take climate change factors into account, and this may be the place to discuss in this management plan. In addition to storms, rising sea level and local impacts from unsustainable land clearing practices in the Sahara, should also be discussed. The impacts from Sahara dust have been linked to health concerns for both humans and coastal resources. Some people suffering respiratory issues have left the island and / or can be seen wearing masks during dust storms. We can no longer claim to have no air quality issues as was the case in the last Culebra Segment. Similarly rising sea surface temperatures have been linked to the declining health of both human and marine organisms around Culebra.	Climate change and its implications were considered in this revision and update.
Climate	Coralatons	The health of water recreators, (Culebra's arroz and habitueles), is directly threatened by the runoff of organisms pathogenic to humans and other animals...waterborne pathogens that proliferate in warming seas. (Citation Pending...National Academy Press 1999: From Monsoons to Microbes). / Coastal runoff has been linked to fibropapilloma tumor formation on Culebra sea turtles (2004 Carlos Diez et al DRNA PR). A local doctor believes are a result to exposure to local declining coastal water quality. (Support statement from the doctor will be submitted by Oct 31, 2008, Citations from UPR Med Sciences Campus/Coral Reef Research Group)" (p. 309).	Coastal water pollution was acknowledged as one of the problems in the Culebra Segment.
		Issue: Mt. Resaca RS Rockland: An illegally permitted development project resulting in sub-terrainian piping of water that led to underground creeks emerging along the downland side of the Mountain, damaging neighboring property and coastal waters. Under no circumstances should this area be allowed for more dense zonation. Development of this area as it has been demonstrated from this illegal attempt, will irreparably harm diverse local ecology, impact coastal waters and result in landslides and possible loss of life. An aquifer is present in this area" (p. 310). (Case Study Mt. Resaca, Appendix pending)	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP.
Geology	Coralatons	"Culebra has at least two active aquifers not mentioned in the draft plan. The water wells of Culebra have been mapped and studied by the USGS. It has been discussed locally that these hand built marvels should be considered for cultural historic recognition and preservation, as they also coincide with some of the original settlement areas. USGS study indicates they have all since been contaminated with salt. (Citation pending).	The information on the Segment is from the Groundwater Atlas of the USGS (1996).
		CZM Issue: In 2000 and 2001 we took photos of the Costa Bonita Resort project pulling water from one of the wells to use in the construction of the Villas. This well was located at the intersection of their access road with PR Road 250 to construct their villas. PRASA workers were pulling salt water from some well to mix with concrete used on the road to cover the sewer tube project. The CB incident was reported to agencies who said that no agency had jurisdiction over the source of water being used for construction projects. *RECOMMENDED POLICY*.	The process of revision and update does not include additional policies.
Hydrology	Coralatons	(Summary of comment) "More studies have been done on Culebra on flora than have been reflected in this section and it may be a good idea to consolidate this information today. For example, the existing USFWS HRP for the endangered endemic P. wheeleri indicates the plant is found on the Refuge, but this is not where the 1976 EIS evaluating Navy lands transfer placed it..."Not mentioned in the draft is that Leptocereus grantianus is found in the SW coast where the dense Villa Mi Terruño project is underway..."Also of importance are dry forest areas of the SE where dense populations of Guayacom oficonalis are found. In the Mosquito watershed, for example, large trees are found that are proliferating seedlings in areas that could be destroyed by landscaping practices now associated with five acre lot development insensitive and powerful watersheds...	The information about P. wheeleri, of Leptocereus grantianus, was included as background information.
		(Summary of comment) : This plan should include more information on fauna... and...show a map that documents where these animals [endangered or critical species] have been found...and associated habitat". "Fauna section should look to all studies to consolidate findings to date as well. There should also be a section on introduced fauna, since this is having a profound impact on wilderness areas...Currently this the critical habitat for the Virgin Islands booby by verbal trend to favor urbanization instead of agriculture in management planning seems to ignore asort of a free range agricultural grazing practice that continues. E. monensis is of particular concern on Culebra as it should be throughout the region.	Information and maps of critical habitats were included, as well as the proposed designation of the critical habitat for the Virgin Islands booby by the DNER.
Flora	Coralatons	"Endangered Species: While the Culebra section mentions FWS designated critical habitat for sea turtles, it does not mention the NOAA designated critical habitat for sea turtles and coral. These areas are not shown graphically in the documents maps; rather they are lost in the text. These federal designations weigh heavily during the Federal Consistency review of the CZMP and the areas should clearly be shown on the map illustrations".	Maps of the critical habitats designated by NOAA and USFWS were included.
Fauna	Coralatons	"The list of beaches is not complete. This is critical in that this plan list every beach on Culebra since privatization of these valuable resources has been a concern of late. Playa Tortolo, Playa Blanca, Playa Sardinera, Playa Dattiles are some that are missing, but a comprehensive list will be provided by Oct 31,2008. It is very important with regard to these resources that a physical characterization of beach type be provided with some description of their ecological and economic importance as well as what threatens them.	Other beaches were included in the background information. Map 18 of beaches provides information about the composition of these.
Beaches	Coralatons		

PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Mangroves	Coralations	(Summary of comment) "1990 information provided regarding mangroves of Culebra is not complete. We recommend that you combine the section on Manglares with Cuerpos de Aguas Superficiales into "Coastal Wetlands." Wetlands should be mapped and indicated on maps with reference to watersheds.	The information used is from an inventory of mangroves made by the DNER in 1990. Maps in Chapter 3 contain information about wetlands, mangroves, etc. in Puerto Rico, including Culebra.
Superficial water bodies	Coralations	(Summary of comment) "(see comments under Manglares about combining resources to facilitate a more eco-system based management approach) In addition to consolidating the listing of the coastal wetlands in one section, all should be aggressively protected by this plan as areas of particular concern for the ecological function...."	All the mangroves in Puerto Rico, including Culebra's, have been designated as SPA and count with a management plan adopted by the PRPB.
Reefs	Coralations	"Much more needs to be included in this section, and it is of particular importance given the mission focus of our organization. This needs to be expanded and we plan to elaborate. For the record, we believe this section must be expanded to include: Ecological, physical and economic importance of these systems in general to coastal island communities, if nothing specific is known for Culebra./- Federally protected species listing (Acroporids)/System is Crashing referencing data up to 2003 and then post 2005 (UPR Coral reef Research Group)/ Many octocorals are yet to be identified and named./- Comprehensive list of fish and shellfish associated with this community including what is known of population trends./- Coral Research and Restoration projects (finca de coral)/Restoration opportunities for volunteers after storms and hurricanes/government support and partnerships./- Mapping and monitoring opportunities for volunteers after storms and hurricanes./- List of local NGO's based on the island working 12 amendment	See section on Corals 3.2.2. Beside, a map of critical habitats is included illustrating the area of A. palmata and cervicinis, and the section was updated with recent information.
		Regulations: Coral Reef Law 147, 1999 indicates that no project that could pose harm to coral reefs or related habitats can be undertaken without benefit of an EIS....This should apply to all of Culebra.	Law No. 147 is extensive to all coral reefs, coral communities and associate marine systems of Puerto Rico, including Culebra.
Marine grasslands	Coralations	"Should include map with federal designations including Critical Habitat and Resource Category 1 designations... Appendix on Regulations Pending/Should reference recent studies on trends in sea grass health (UPR Coral Reef Research Group)/Should reference recent studies on trends in associated species, i.e. Conch (UPR Coral Reef Research Group)"/Regulations: Coral Reef Law 147, 1999 indicates that no project that could pose any threat to coral reefs or related habitats can be undertaken without benefit of an EIS....This should apply to all of Culebra.	A map was included with the officially designated critical habitats.
Natural Protected Areas	Coralations	"We are concerned and question the serious decline in area represented by maps in the first Culebra Segment for protected areas to the maps presented in this plan. A comment is made that areas of the Monte and Playa Resaca are protected and restricted when serious damage has happened with DRNA land clearing permits to this area where property ownership and USFWS jurisdiction was not clarified..."	Corrected map was included.
	Susan Silander/Ana Roman USFWS	Section 5.4 is lacking the following information: "The Culebra National Wildlife Refuge is the oldest in the Caribbean, established in 1909.../Likewise, a portion of the designated critical habitat of the Culebra Island giant anole (Anolis roosevelti) (USFWS, 1983) is found within the lands managed by the USFWS. Also, the Virgin Islands Tree boa (Epicrates monensis granti), listed as endangered by the USFWS, could be found in areas of the Refuge's dry forest. About the latter, the DNER prepared the draft document for the designation of its critical habitat in Culebra. To date, it is unknown the status of this document which included lands of the Culebra Refuge in its designation. We recommend to communicate with Mr. Eduardo Ventosa to find out the status of the document and if this was finalized the information be included in this Plan.	Information of the proposal for designating the critical habitat of the Epicrates monensis granti was included. However, it is important to consider that it is a proposal still under the consideration of the DNER Secretary.
	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"Map 28: Natural Protected Areas on Culebra, does not accurately show the extent of the Culebra Islands National Wildlife Refuge which should include parts of Puerto del Manglar and the other off shore cays. Please contact the Caribbean Islands National Wildlife Office for correct Refuge boundaries".	A Map was included with the corresponding areas.
Energy	Coralations	"Last Culebra Segment indicated that Culebra should not be relied upon in the production of an industrialized energy source and we believe this statement should be incorporated in this version of the plan as well".	See Energy section in the Culebra Segment.
Tourism	Coralations	"Table 5-4 from Campaña de Turismo 2006 is not at all accurate for number of Employees at Costa Bonita. This project was an abject failure. It serves as an example of why Government should not be fast tracking development in partnership with any government agency on the island.	General comment outside the scope of the PRCZMP.
Transportation	Coralations	"The transportation infrastructure for the island has always been compromised. Ferries pollute passenger areas and Ley Num 231 26 de Agosto has not made things better. (appendix case study Transportation)...There is no local control regarding the permitting of públicos, so an influx of off island público drivers now competes with local people for these jobs. This is also the case with off island tourism vessels taking 50 and 60 people for check out dives at Carlos Rosario. First time divers in large groups with little supervision damage coral already stressed by development practices and climate change. This is not benefiting local tourism economy. Policy changes could change this through local control by the municipal government that limits commercial boats / boat taxis to 12 pack licenses. Commercial cruise ships have been documented as causing as much as 300m2 of damage with one anchor drop. Commercial cruise vessels should not be anchoring in Culebra's waters.	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Pollution	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"The Culebra Segment of the PRCZMP was established in 1976 but over the years it has not functioned as planned. Coastal impacts from runoff and sediment originating from upland development continues to this day. Impacts to the islands limited coastal mangrove fringe continue and the sewage treatment plant is still non operational leaving residents little choice but to discharge into the ocean and bays. Impacts on Culebra are well documented but little has been done in the last 30 years to resolve the issues".	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
	Coralations	"...The Parson's risk assessment study concluded all but one of the zones on Culebra as medium or high priority for clean up. This map should be included in your final document. Finally this information should be used to implement some management measures to protect coastal user groups since clean up has been slow on land, and not expected to be funded in the water..."	Information about USACE's cleaning activities was included.
Maritime Zone delimitation	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"We agree with the document that the maritime terrestrial zone on Culebra needs to be established for the entire island. This needs to be done in coordination with the FWS Culebra National Wildlife Refuge since there may be overlapping jurisdictions and boundaries".	General comment: no action required.
CHAPTER 6: The Vieques Segment			
Reefs	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	Section 6.4.2 Reefs, p. 368. If this is an area where the less disturbed corals are, the use of recreational boats should be limited (including personal water crafts as jet skies) by implanting a system of mooring buoys. The Plan should provide for the prevention and surveillance for the proper use of the resource.	These restrictions could be considered in more specific plans, as the management plan for Vieques's coastal waters.
Recreation	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	Section 6.5.3 Recreation, p. 372. If the existing areas cannot be maintained, how the Plan guarantees the conservation of the environment and facilities when the number of people and boats increase in it?	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Energy	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	Section 6.6 Energy, p. 373. With the current demand there is no need of expansion but if the vision is to attract more people and tourism it should be consider the use of other sources of energy (i.e. eolic with the wind patterns of the East zone) to cover this increase in population and commerce as a sustainable development.	See section 6.1.7 (a) Energy
Pollution	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"DNER needs to consult with the EPA and PR EQB on the number of known contaminated sites on Vieques and the degree of contamination".	Information updated in the final PRCZMP.

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Coastal barriers	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"On Vieques there were numerous Coastal Barrier units not accepted because there were US Navy lands. These can be re-nominated by the Commonwealth for inclusion as full coastal barriers or "otherwise protected" units".	Recommendation was included.
APPENDIX B			
Excluded Federal Lands	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	"The document does not includes information regarding Excluded Federal Lands. In the current document, this information is included under appendix B-9. It is necessary to review the current status of lands whose use is subject by law exclusively to the discretion of the Federal Government. Some lands (Vieques, Roosevelt Roads, etc) were transferred to the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico and it is necessary to make an inventory in order to generate a new map indicating the lands still under the exclusive federal jurisdiction. In this aspect, is important to consider the experience of the Navy in Vieques and be clear in the definition of the spillover effects. The Federal Government has exclusive jurisdiction in some areas, but the Commonwealth could make claims if carried out activities, which even though are in lands outside its jurisdiction, have negative impacts over the lands and the resources covered by the Program.	See Appendix B.
Means of exerting Commonwealth control	Dr. Antonio Rodriguez	(Summary of comment) "Summary of comment) I reviewed the list of regulations from the DNER and the EQB in Appendix B, against the relevant list of regulations from the Puerto Rico Department of State. In both cases, I highlighted what I understand as discrepancies that must be resolved to ensure a complete legal base, correct and up to date. I include the corresponding Word document, both for the DNER and EQB, as well as for the PRPB and RPA, even though I did not verify these latter. Also, I noticed the lack of legal base from the Department of Agriculture in Appendix B, when this is one of the key agencies in regard to non-point sources of pollution. Although the topic of non-point sources of pollution is discussed in diverse sections of the main document, there is just one and vague reference to non-point sources in Appendix-B. Also, even though in the main document the topic on non-point sources is included in diverse sections and there is a mention of the incorporation process from the Non-point Sources Program, the reality is, in my opinion, that the document never considered the incorporation of the Non-point Sources Program, in the federal legal context under the terms of the CZMA. If this was not the intention of the DNER, the correspondent additional corrections should be made.	The means or authorities of the PRCZMP of 1978 and the ones included later through RPC are an integral part of the Program in this revision and update. The Program of Non-point Sources of Pollution is not part of the PRCZMP. However, the tasks performed under this are mentioned in the section of Coastal Waters.
APPENDIX C			
Description of SPA and NRs	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	"The Appendix C from the current document contains a detailed description of the Special Planning Areas (SPA) and Natural Reserves (NR). The document presented is not including this information and we understand it is important. The delimitation of the maps from all the NRs should be updated and include as an appendix, besides updating the descriptive information."	Included in the Appendix C of the final PRCZMP.
OTHER COMMENTS			
Public participation	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	"The current document also includes an appendix dedicated to public participation (appendix E) that is not included in the final draft. It is understood that this part will be incorporated after collecting all the information from public hearings, celebrated during the month of September of 2008.	Included in Appendix D
	Att. Patricio Martínez-Lorenzo (Home Builders Association)	Suggest preparing an adequate document for public hearings that correctly inform the public and other interested parties about the nature and extension of what is proposed and its amendments. The current format does not inform the public about the nature of the proposed changes and therefore does not promote public participation.	A letter will be mailed. For the process of revision and update, public meetings were conducted since no additional policies are added.
Incorporation of Sustainable Development, Watersheds as a Planning Unit, Climate Change and Sea level Rise	Att. Patricio Martínez-Lorenzo (Home Builders Association)	Suggest to postpone the incorporation of the elements of sustainable development, watersheds as a planning unit and the precautionary principles (climate change and sea level rise) until appropriate standards are established and approved and criteria and guidelines to assist stakeholders in the implementation of these. These concepts are extremely ambiguous and controversial. The absence of guidelines on how agencies and stakeholder will apply or comply with these new policies proposed, which in the case of climate change and sea level rise are a speculative declaration of risk, together, with the absence of objective criteria or standards to evaluate specific projects or activities, highlight the vagueness and ambiguity and therefore will promote conflict, delay and expenditures in the evaluation of coastal projects and its approval. Therefore, should dismiss the incorporation of these. Regarding the concept of sustainable development, should propose specific guidelines for intelligent development or principles and concepts of sustainable development design, similar to the ones adopted by the CZMP in other states such as Virginia and Hawaii, before including it in the document. Currently, the Plan does not includes a definite form of public policy for sustainable development, only mentions the concept and no define activities are established or procedures for its implantation. The way presented results ambiguous. /Moreover, the DNER vision of incorporating these issues and proposed changes in public policy are also in disagreement with national policies set by Section 303 of the CZMA and do require amendments to the document.	A letter will be sent. Climate change: Just acknowledge the context in which the document is updated. Section 307 of the CZMA, Indirect Impacts, besides the Coastal Non Point Pollution Program, approved by the EPA and NOAA. Sustainable development and watersheds: these concepts area included in the OPP-PUTPR (1995) that were included to the PRCZMP through RPC in year 2003. See Section 302 (Congressional findings) which leads to Section 303.
Process of incorporating changes to the Plan	Att. Patricio Martínez-Lorenzo (Home Builders Association)	Proposed changes are substantial amendments and not a revision and update as established by the DNER. The DNER propose the incorporation of substantial changes to policies and regulations without complying with the regulation of incorporation changes to the program established by NOAA or the OCRM. The DNER should follow the guidelines and requirements established by NOAA/OCRM for the adoption of amendments to the document contained in the 15 CFR 923.81. On the other hand, the public announcement prepared by the DNER does not inform the public about the nature of the changes and the extent of the amendments proposed. New public hearing should be celebrated and a new public announcement informing adequately about the true extent, nature and significance of the proposed amendments.	Public policies were not modified during this process, they were directly taken from the 1978 document. What was updated were the data and information on physical-natural and socioeconomic of the document and were placed in the context of the best scientific and technical knowledge at the time, at global level as well as federally and locally.
Regulations on construction in the coastal zone	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	"We recommend being more specific on the subject of regulatory permits for construction in the coastal zone. Establish how far construction will not be allowed and delimit it. If when granting a construction permit priority will be given to projects promoting harmony with nature". / It should review the regulatory approval of building permits in the Maritime Zone to make this more environmentally friendly. A law should be created to make mandatory for every construction project planned in the coastal zone to have minimum impact in the environment and such project has a management plan for its solid wastes".	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
	Att. José L. Navas (Representative of Pallisades Inc.)	"According to the amendments, every owner of land adjoining the Maritime Zone shall have the obligation to yield to public use a strip of land of 20 meters inland from the point where the Maritime Zone ends; after this point forward, will be subject to a prohibition of developing the next 30 meters, for a total of 50 meters subject to cession and use restriction. These conditions are illegal because constitute a 'taking' without the proper compensation required by both the Commonwealth Constitution and the US Constitution. Under the fifth amendment of the US Constitution, it is required a compensation to the owner before depriving of his property; under the Fourteenth Amendment of the U.S. Constitution, a problem arises of due process of law in its substantive dimension; because the state action is arbitrary and capricious, as the nexus between that action and the interest to protect and/or advance is attenuated, but completely absent."/ We respectfully suggest to consult these precedents (cases: Nollan V. Coates with PR EQB". eas are protected, those recommended for protection, those agricultural reserves, those areas of agricultural value recommended for protection, watersheds, wetlands and pertinent buffer zones, particularly, keeping a set back or buffer zone against the rise in sea level	The PRCZMP reviewed and updated does not include such proposal. It only cites the statutes and the current regulation, among there is Planning Regulation No. 17 that was made integral part of the Program through the mechanism of RPC.

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Regulations on construction in the coastal zone (cont.)	Carlos Gastón (Biologist and Realtor)	I understand the DNER have not complied with the correctly delimitation of the Maritime Zone and a case that is an example of this irresponsibility is complaint 2007- 0032 ZMT which led to internal adjudicative proceedings in the DNER that has not been resolved. This case involves the DNER, DTPW, USFWS, US DOT, Department of Historic Heritage, IPRC, the PRPB and RPA. Complaint attached.	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Maps	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"The document maps may be too small to adequately interpret properly in the hard copy version. Fold out maps should be considered for the hard copy version".	Included in size 11 X 17
Federal Critical Habitats	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"Federally designated critical habitat within the areas designated as coastal zone is no adequately described either in the text or in the enclosed maps. Please coordinate with our office and NMFS to assure that all federally designated habitats are included".	Included in the text and in the maps.
Environmental Impact Statement	Blanca Rodríguez - Inversiones Cacimar	Request an EIS	The document does not incorporate substantial changes. The NOAA and EQB will be contacted for comments.
	Altn. Patricia Martínez-Lorenzo (Home Builders Association)	"The agency has not complied with the environmental impact review process. Given the numerous changes, based in the new information and sometimes conclusive and questionable, which the DNER has adopted to advance important public policy changes with potential environmental impact, the agency should comply with the Environmental Public Policy Law".	The document does not incorporate substantial changes. The NOAA and EQB will be contacted for comments.
Federal Consistency Certification	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	"The information about the Compatibility Certifications should not be included within the statistics for site consultations because the Federal Consistency Certification (FCC) is not an adjudicative process and cannot be used as an indicator of growth or urban development. A FCC certifies (does not authorizes) a discharge, as well as filling of a wetland, or construction of a pier, etc. and on the other side the FCC does not guarantee project approval."	Reviewed.
	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"The only CZMP program that consistently functions is that of Federal Consistency. Federal agencies are required to seek CZM consistency prior to issuing a permit or taking action. It has been our experience that the majority of denials of federal permits have been because of PR Planning Board's denial of CZM consistency". /	The PRPB is the agency in charge of evaluating the Federal Consistency Process for all local and federal statutes that have been included as enforceable policies of the Program.
	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"There is one exception with Federal Consistency. Federal actions usually occur late in the project planning phase after many of the local permits are already been obtained. At times PR Planning is faced with a project that has received a zoning or other permit from the PR Planning Board during local review, but now does not comply with Federal Consistency. This dilemma is usually solved by the Board not taking action and letting the established time limits to expire or simply issuing Federal Consistency regardless of the comments received. Because of the Commonwealth does not have a local equivalent of Federal Consistency, projects that may impact the coastal zone and which may not comply with Federal Consistency can go through the Commonwealth regulatory process without CZM issues, problems then arise at the Federal permitting phase placing an undue burden on Federal regulatory and commenting agencies".	General comment: no action required. The corresponding referral will be made.
Enforceable Policies	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	Clarify the language as to what is the Program enforceable Public Policy. It should be noted and cite that Section 930.58 of the Regulation of Consistency Procedures with the Program in the 15 CFR part 930 establish the following: / (a) The applicant shall furnish the State agency with necessary data and information along with the consistency certification. Such information and data shall include the following: / (2) Information specifically identified in the management program as required necessary data and information for an applicant's consistency certification. The management program as originally approved or amended (pursuant to 15 CFR part 923, subpart H) may describe data and information necessary to assess the consistency of federal license or permit activities. Necessary data and information may include completed State or local government permit applications which are required for the proposed activity, but shall not include the issued State or local permits "Considering this it is important (medullar) that the document clearly indicates what the laws, regulations and Commonwealth endorsements required for different types of activities carried out or that may affect soil and resources located within Puerto Rico's coastal zone. Currently we are confronting much difficulty for implementing the Program through the Federal Consistency Procedures due to the lack of clarity in the current document to identify the enforceable public policies."	Clarified in Appendix B.
Federal Excluded Lands	Ángel Rodríguez- PRPB	"The document lacks information about federal lands excluded, Natural Reserves and Special Planning Areas. This information exists within the document in effect under Appendixes B and C and should be updated."	Clarified in Appendix B.
Zoning Regulation/ Qualification of PR	Clarimar Diaz- DNER	"Some parts the document cited the Zoning Regulation of Puerto Rico. This document, currently, is known as the "Puerto Rico Qualification Regulation", Planning Regulation No. 4 of June 28 of 2008. The information cited from the older Regulation should be revised for the purpose of evaluating if it keeps relation with the new version of the Regulation".	Reviewed.
Streams	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"Streams: While the document mentions several laws and regulations that are meant to protect streams, it continues to be common construction practice to eliminate streams in urban development and make them part of the project's internal underground drainage. There does not seem to be a strong public policy to discourage this practice by either PR Planning Board or ARPE. This practice should not be allowed in new development projects. Likewise small stream crossings that have less impact on the stream channel such as span bridges, bottomless culverts or vaulted bridges should be promoted over the standard concrete pipe or box culvert, these structures can cause severe alterations of the natural stream bed and aquatic habitat".	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Estuaries	Julio Toro- DNER	(Summary of comment) The document under consideration would be incomplete if it does not included a section on estuaries as one of the most important ecosystems in our coastal zone. Estuaries have been ignored- essentially in ecotone between the marine systems and the fresh water systems intertwining our watersheds- since the conflicts of Puerto Rico's coastal zone started being documented. The concept of ecotone assumes the existence of active interactions between two or more ecosystems and the resurgence of mechanisms that does not exist in the surrounding ecosystems (Naiman et al., 1990). Estuaries are highly productive environments due to the abundant nutrients which are brought by land drainage and the coastal sea. Estuaries provide an important habitat for the development of important fisheries species. Other references cited in the comment are: Negrón & Cintrón (1979) and the document "Fishery Population and Habitat Assessment in Puerto Rico Streams".	See section on Coastal Waters.

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Marinas	Julio Toro- DNER	Undoubtedly, this is a necessary evil. Also, they have become of international importance as a vital component in our important fishing tournaments. Therefore, it is a vital component of nautical tourism. Don't forget DNER gives boat license labels (marbetes) and boats need to be kept somewhere, either in water or in what is known as "dry snack". The location and type of these facilities always has been and will be source of conflicts between "green" groups and the rest of the components of the regulatory/governmental process. Any document like this should or have to include an encompassing section on this topic. Is about time the DNER remove from the box of oblivion the "Guidance for the Location of Marinas in Puerto Rico" prepared by Mayra García and Ramón Martínez. Is about time that such document be revised and updated as objectively as possible and public policy is prepared about this, indicating where proposals for marinas will be accepted. I remind you what was recommended about this in the publication "Puerto Rico and the Sea". In page 18 was indicated that: "because there is not enough public funding for projects such as marinas some public lands should be leased under reasonable terms to private project developers for the construction of marine recreation centers pre-designed at appropriate places. The mechanisms to implement this recommendation, should be establish through statute, and should include measures for environmental protection, such as public hearings for the terms of lease and the prices to be charged for using the facilities.	See section on Coast-dependent Uses. Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Solid wastes: Vieques and Culebra	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	For both Vieques and Culebra we believe that recycling and separation of waste should be mandatory, this can be accomplished either through a Municipal ordinance or other form of regulation. DNER through the Solid Waste Management Agency should seek to implement this as soon as possible".	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Water Conservation: Vieques and Culebra	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"For Vieques and Culebra as well as the south coast of Puerto Rico we recommend mandatory water conservation and construction of cisterns on all new residential and commercial structures. This is a requirement in the Virgin Islands and helps alleviate dependency on limited public water supplies".	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Land Clearing	Edwin Muñiz- USFWS	"For all of Puerto Rico, DNER in coordination with the PREGB, ARPE, and PR Planning Board should seek to develop strict requirement for land clearing that only allow clearance of the footprint of the structure plus 5% of and strict sediment and erosion control measures. Land clearing is strictly controlled in the US Virgin Islands and the total clearing of land lots is not a common practice".	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Education	Sociedad Ambiente Marino	"The value of an informed citizenry on their government public policies and on the importance of these is essential for their success and their specific goals- in this case, in terms of ensuring a sustainable development in coastal zones, taking into consideration the value of the resources involved."/ a. We suggest as an active part of this Management Program to include a section dedicated to the public policy regarding the information and education of citizens about the purposes, dispositions and importance of this Management Program. This could include from advertising campaigns to community workshops discussing aspects as: the value of coastal resources and its conservation; the need and implications of sustainable development of zones and resources; modes of civic collaboration for these purposes; and operating modes and guarantees of the Management Program, among others. This type of civic participation and collaboration, as documented in multiple cases, will greatly increase the effectiveness and efficacy "Puerto Rico and the Sea". In page 18 was indicated that: "because there is not enough public funding for projects such as marinas some public lands should be leased under reasonable terms to private project devel	The education component is worked through Task 5.1 of Section 306 of the CZMP.
Earth crust extraction	Carlos Gastón (Biologist and Realtor)	I understand the DNER has not established an adequate regulation to prevent erosion from earth's crust extraction or agricultural practices.	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.
Compliance to 906	Coralations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The hearings were not well announced by the DRNA... community flyers. As a result, none of the other public hearings were well attended, given the importance of this plan to the people. Today it is unlikely any plan, no matter how important to the people, can be implemented without the political will of the local leaders. The plan is supposed to consolidate agencies and clarify accountability regarding coastal zone issues, when what we have observed is increased fragmentation even within departments of the same agencies. This can be addressed by increasing transparency in the permitting process. The new website should post all permits issued by the department. ACDEC's implementation of the Culebra's current coastal zone management plan...has gone largely ignored with areas that once benefited from protective zoning. When asked, DRNA refused to extend the deadline for written comments which was set at Oct 6th, 2008... The draft plan has made a great start at consolidating the background information needed to create a strong management plan. Implementation would require specific goals and objectives and define benchmarks and timelines. Restrict the anchoring of large commercial vessels in Culebra's waters. Restrict the passage of oil tankers passing within three miles from shore. Prohibit all development on the ecologically sensitive Cays to protect Their value to nature tourism as well as quality of adjacent waters. Prohibit private helicopters from landing outside fly zone of the air port. Prohibit commercial boats greater than 12 packs visiting Culebra cays. Demarcate and Prohibit further development of sensitive wilderness areas, wetlands and coastal barriers. (muellecito, soni) Consider a moratorium for large projects being fast tracked on lands concluded to be of medium or high priority for the clean up of unexploded military ordinance. Consider a moratorium on fast tracked condo / hotel development... Prohibit the construction of marinas in Culebra's waters. Prohibit development in violation of zoning. Prohibit zoning changes without public hearings and an environmental impact study, or integrated and meaningful input from the Coastal Zone Management Office experts. Prohibit the further sale and development of public lands. Expedite titles to full time resident property owners on public lands in exchange for conservation easement for public transfer of lands when all legal heirs are deceased. Prohibit the use of categorical exclusions to fast track development projects and segregations for all of Culebra. Increase government transparency by posting agency progress in official delineations of public domain on a map posted to DRNA website. Provide public notification of public hearings regarding future beach delineations. Establish work plan benchmarks and time lines towards the implementation of specific management objectives, and post progress online. Create meaningful oversight to coastal zone legal conflicts by creating a special Government Ombudsman (Magistrado del Pueblo) to address coastal zone management issues so folks with limited resources have an alternative to court. Pass the coastal zone law (P. de la C 3031), 10 Oct 2006 to eliminate the arbitrary delineations of the public's domain of the shore. Review and integrate all local management plans to insure compliance to coastal zone management plan. Review and address conflicting laws and policies by illustrating specific case studies that demonstrate how implementation of the existing coastal zone management plan over the past few years. 	<p>Dissemination mechanisms used are presented in Appendix B.</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP. The corresponding referral will be made.</p> <p>Comments received after this date were incorporated in the final revision of the PRCZMP.</p> <p>General comment/Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>A project is been conducted for a base delimitation of the Maritime Zone. See Chapter 3.</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>Outside the scope of the PRCZMP</p> <p>The plans were integrated to the document of the PRCZMP.</p>

**PUERTO RICO COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC MEETINGS**

CHAPTER	PERSON WHO ISSUED THE COMMENT	COMMENT	ACTION OR RESPONSE TO THE COMMENT
Compliance to 906 (cont.)	Correlations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Culebra segment, ACDEC and meaningful oversight. ACDEC board went from being top heavy on off island administrators to a board now functioning that could benefit from greater expertise. Law 66 requires amending to include both local governance in balance with meaningful management. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recommended policy changes to stop the continued fragmentation of departments within agencies and unite relevant and agencies with more focused accountability. 	The process of review and update does not include additional policies. The agencies responsible of the development process in the coastal zone are presented in Chapter 4.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Plan must respect and protect all existing access roads and trails to beaches, consistent with the Puerto Rico Constitution. 	One of the fundamental tasks of the PRCZMP is the provision of coastal access (Task 1.6.4 of Section 9).
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aid coastal municipal leaders by providing sample draft ordinance designed by hydrologists to reduce or eliminate muddy runoff into coastal waters and rivers. (we have a draft template) 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use website to increase transparency on all DRNA land clearing permits issued. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> DRNA policy should require that a Plan CES be presented prior to receiving a land clearing permit and not as a requirement for later. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Require a sworn statement signed that permit applications own the property where work is proposed. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Land clearing permits for small project must be given meaningful local enforcement. Vigilantes need to be trained on how to measure this impact. They should understand that major construction of roads etc...is not acceptable under Permiso Simple. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> JCA charge more for Plan CES to insure budget for meaningful enforcement. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Create local jobs implementing plans geared at the restoration, mapping or monitoring of coastal resources, waters, watersheds and fisheries. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide draft management plans for coastal municipal Civil Defense to create long term disaster plan for hurricanes and Tsunamis including the acquisition and conservation of area lands suitable for public development should tragedy strike and the shoreline community be in need of massive relocation. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aid coastal municipality partners by providing sample draft ordinance to streamline solid waste management with a plan focused on recycling, reuse, job creation and proper disposal of toxic waste. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aid coastal municipality partners by empowering them with draft ordinance to reduce non-point coastal runoff (sample ordinance pending appendix) 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
Implementation of Non-point pollution solutions in Culebra		<p>"Green practices" training and certifications for Culebra heavy machinery operators. Decrease road width definitions for dirt road construction on Culebra. Increase regulation and oversight for dirt road construction. Train local vigilantes for enforcement. Major infrastructure Watershed restoration plans hiring local certified workers.</p>	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP
Policy Plan CES	Correlations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> DRNA and JCA should increase application fee for land clearing permit to insure both agencies can cover enforcement of erosion control. Plan CES must involve a bonding in the contract to insure that fines can be collectedthis also insures meaningful oversight and jobs. A developer should not be able to obtain any land clearing permits form DRNA without presenting a Certified Plan CES and/ or Federal NPDES storm water prevention plan if required by law All Plan CES and Land Clearing Permits should be posted online, and at development sites. DRNA should not grant land clearing permits for any projects that do not have ARPE permits, and for projects moving in violation of existing zoning. Regional offices should be eliminated to reduce fragmentation and increase transparency and accountability within the agency. Plan CES must focus on planning and not just limit itself to implementation of temporary erosion control measures. Major impacts on Culebra come from dirt roads that cannot be blocked by the temporary measures and whose chronic impact to coastal water bodies stems from poor planning. Educational workshops for local Rangers so they are empowered to take action on erosion control violations and so they clearly understand and can explain to developers the irreparable harm erosion causes coastal water bodies. Rangers/enforcement ombudsman. To date we have filed many formal complaints to DRNA office of enforcement on Culebra. 	Outside the scope of the PRCZMP